

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Planning Reference No: | 10/3262N |
| Application Address: | Land adjacent to 97 Broughton Road, Crewe |
| Proposal: | Redevelopment of the Existing Retail Premises "Crewe Saddlery" and the Erection of 11 Dwellings and Associated Access, Parking and Garden Areas |
| Applicant: | Fieldcrest Partnership |
| Application Type: | Full Planning Application |
| Grid Reference: | 370333 357654 |
| Ward: | Crewe East |
| Earliest Determination Date: | 29 th September 2010 |
| Expiry Dated: | 19 th November 2010 |
| Date of Officer's Site Visit: | 11 th October 2010 |
| Date Report Prepared: | 15 th October 2010 |
| Constraints: | Wind Turbine Development Consultation Area Contaminated Land |

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION:

Subject to the views of the Strategic Highways Manager in relation to the amended plans, approve with conditions

MAIN ISSUES:

- Principle of redevelopment for residential use
- Design
- Highway Matters
- Residential amenity
- Ecology
- Landscape
- Sustainable Development

1. REASON FOR REFERRAL

This application is to be determined by the Southern Planning Committee because the proposal is for 11 dwellings.

2. DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND CONTEXT

The site is a Backland location situated behind the dwellings at 71-87 Broughton Road. The land is generally level and is occupied by single storey buildings which form the Crewe Saddlery retail business, stables and small paddocks. Buildings are small in scale and constructed from timber, blockwork and cladding and there are portacabins on site. Access to the Saddlery is between 87 and 99 Broughton Road and this will be retained to serve the new residential development, subject to detailed modification. The existing owner's dwelling is 97 Broughton Road which is situated some 40m down the drive. It is proposed that this dwelling be retained. The access also serves a bungalow known as 99A Broughton Road which is situated behind 101-107 Broughton Road. A group of five garages is also present alongside the access.

Immediately to the west of the application site are a small stable block, related hardstanding and paddock. This area is outside of the settlement boundary and for this reason has been excluded from the application site.

The site is located within the Crewe settlement boundary however land to the west and south is outside the settlement boundary.

3. DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

The application seeks planning permission for 11 new dwellings whilst retaining the existing dwelling at 97 Broughton Road. The existing group of five garages near the site access are to be replaced with four car parking spaces. Amended plans have been received which modify the details of the access and highway within the site and re-arrange the layout of dwellings on the south side of the site. These plans have been sent out for consultation and responses on the amended plans will be reported in the Updates to the Committee agenda.

The amended plans retain the link detached two storey dwellings at plots 1 and 2 and plots 3 and 4 as well as the pair of semi-detached dwellings at plots 10 and 11. In the amended plans plot 7 is repositioned as a detached dwelling at the head of the cul de sac and plots 5/6 and plots 8/9 are provided as semi-detached dwellings in the corners of the cul de sac.

All dwellings are two storey and each curtilage includes 2 parking spaces. Properties are a mixture of two, three and four bedroomed dwellings.

The highway modifications include the removal of the front porch at 97 Broughton Road and the introduction of a road layout based on Manual for Streets whereby a single surface provides for vehicle carriageway, pedestrian access, service strip and a limited amount of parking and planting within highway land. The junction with Broughton Road will be defined with kerbs along Broughton Road to improve visibility whilst maintaining a 5.5m wide carriageway to Broughton Road. The removal of the porch at 97 Broughton Road will allow for a surface 600mm wide immediately in front of 97 Broughton Road to be raised slightly to ensure that vehicles and pedestrians do not pass too close to the windows in the front elevation. The carriageway will be constructed with variable width throughout its length. The first section will be 4.5m wide with a separate pedestrian path 1.6m wide to a point beyond the car parking spaces. In front of 97 Broughton Road this will narrow to 4.8m wide and into the site the carriageway will initially widen to 5.8m before decreasing again to 4.8m wide.

4. RELEVANT HISTORY

09/4222N Redevelopment for 11 dwellings. Withdrawn 19th February 2010.

5. POLICIES

The development plan for this area includes the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan 2011.

Local Plan Policy

RES.2 Unallocated Housing Sites

RES.3 Housing Densities
BE.1 Amenity
BE.2 Design
BE.3 Access and Parking
BE.4 Drainage Utilities and Resources
BE.6 Potentially Contaminated Land
NE.5 Nature Conservation and Habitats
NE.9 Protected Species
TRAN. 9 Car Parking Standards

The Cheshire Replacement Waste Local Plan

Policy 10 Minimising Waste During Construction and Development
Policy 11 Development and Waste Recycling

Other Material Considerations

SPD Development on Backland and Gardens
Manual for Streets
PPS1: Delivering Sustainable Development
PPS3: Housing
PPS9: Biodiversity and Geological Conservation
PPG13: Transport

6. CONSULTATIONS

Strategic Highways Manager: No written response has been received from the Strategic Highways Manager however a meeting took place with the agent, planning and highway officers to discuss the amended layout. Following the submission of amended plans a response will be prepared which will be reported in the Updates to the Committee agenda.

Environmental Health: Do not object to the application subject to the following conditions -:

1. Details of external lighting to be submitted and approved due to the proximity of the site to existing dwellings.
2. Restrictions to hours of construction and deliveries
3. Details of pile driving to be submitted approved and implemented, if required.
4. The site is located within 250m of a known landfill site or area of ground that has potential to create gas and as such a condition should be attached for a contaminated land survey and report with remediation if necessary.

Ecology: Do not object to the application. It is not expected that there will be any significant protected species issues as a result of the development but conditions should be attached to any permission to protect breeding birds and ensure provision is made within the development for breeding birds and roosting bats.

United Utilities : No objections provided surface water does not discharge to any foul/ combined sewer to prevent foul flooding and pollution of the environment. The site should be drained on a separate system. Surface water should discharge to SUDS/ soakaways and may require consent from the Environment Agency.

Cheshire Fire Authority: Offer comments in relation to the access for fire services, water supplies, means of escape, and the use of automatic water suppression systems.

7. OTHER REPRESENTATIONS:

Letters of objection have been received from 71, 83, 87, 99 Broughton Road, and comments from 99A Broughton Road.

The grounds of objection/ comment can be summarised as follows:-

- The Transport Statement submitted is based on a survey from 2008 and there is much less traffic using the site now particularly since the business has reduced its hours and customer numbers have dropped. The development should be based on the level of traffic currently using the site.
- It is difficult to exit from the site particularly when cars are parked on Broughton Road which is not very wide. There is a bend in the road not far from the access point and the footpath is narrow.
- The access track is narrow and does not allow 2 vehicles to pass and will not provide sufficient space for people using wheelchairs or buggies.
- There are many vehicles and pedestrians using Broughton Road. The development will generate extra vehicles which would be a risk to public safety.
- People ignore the speed restriction on Broughton Road and will ignore speed restriction measures within the site.
- With the white line detail proposed at the site access vehicles will project out of the access point and collide with on-coming vehicles in Broughton Road
- 99A Broughton Road exits onto the access track from a blind position.
- The addition of white lines at the access will not make it any safer.
- The site access point will be hard to find in winter, fog etc and is in a poor state of repair.
- How will emergency vehicles access the site?
- Note the limited length and width of the access.
- The submitted plans fail to show the rear access to the dwellings in Broughton Road. The drive which currently serves the Saddlery, 97 and 99A Broughton Road also serves the rear of three dwellings on Broughton Road.
- The garages are not unsightly as stated in the application and are used. To replace them with car parking spaces would result in vehicles left in the open and vulnerable.
- Insufficient parking within the development will lead to vehicles parking on Broughton Road.
- Loss of open aspect at the rear of existing dwellings
- Overlooking from the proposed development to existing dwellings
- Overdevelopment taking into account the number of properties proposed and the nature of the access.
- Too much green space is being built on.
- Devaluation of existing properties.
- Potential damage to the dwelling at 87 Broughton Road when the garages are demolished. Also heavy construction traffic, plant and machinery could make the area dangerous particularly bearing in mind the narrowness of the access.
- Mud and debris on the road from construction traffic and potential damage to fences from mud and water splashing those fences adjacent to the site
- The provision of new drainage systems, gas, electricity supply and water supply could result in damage to existing supplies and increased demand on those supplies adversely affecting existing properties.

8. APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING INFORMATION:

Design and Access Statement (Prepared by Fieldcrest Partnership and dated 2010)

- The site has an area of 0.35 ha and is currently occupied by Crewe Saddlery, with the owner living at 97 Broughton Road
- The scheme provides a density of 31 dwellings per hectare with a mix of house types, at an appropriate density bearing in mind the nature of the surrounding development.
- It will not adversely impact on existing residential amenities.
- Landscaping will provide a soft edge to the settlement boundary.
- The layout provides a development fronting onto its access road.
- At 2 storeys in height the development reflects the scale of dwellings in the area.
- It was considered that roof heights were excessive in the earlier scheme and the ridge heights have been reduced accordingly.
- A native hedge of blackthorn and hawthorn will be provided to the site boundary and public spaces will be landscaped using native species.
- Access to dwellings will ensure maximum accessibility to all buildings, being wheelchair friendly.
- Sustainable development measures include the position and orientation of dwellings as far as practical to maximise the use of natural light; roof, wall and floor insulation; use of double glazing with "low E glass"; where possible locally sourced materials; where possible retain existing materials from existing buildings on site for re-use in roadways and floor slabs; the use of

high efficiency boilers; use of rainwater harvesting; use of permeable materials for parking and hard surfacing; domestic composting facilities for each dwelling; and the use of solar panels.

- The site is located in an area of low risk from flooding.
- Foul drainage is available in Broughton Road.
- Surface water will be controlled through the use of permeable materials to hardstandings, rain water harvesting and the installation of rainwater butts for individual properties for garden use.
- The existing site is used for retail purposes and therefore requirements to market the site for alternative employment uses do not apply. There is no manufacturing or production of goods on site.

Access Statement (Prepared by Andrew Gough undated)

- A Traffic Generation study shows that an average daily trip rate of 73.5 movements per day excluding movements associated with 99A Broughton Road.
- Using an average figure of 6-9 movements per dwelling per day this allows for 8-12 dwellings within the redevelopment.
- In terms of traffic generation from the development of 11 houses this would result in 11 movements in the peak hour equating to one movement every 5.45 minutes which would not have any detrimental impact on safe movement or the free flow of traffic on Broughton Road or pedestrians using the footway.
- The proposed development will not therefore result in any increase in vehicle movements over and above that of the authorised site activity. The loss of larger horse boxes/ trailers will be a benefit.
- The proposed access width is adequate to cater for the development including pedestrian needs.

Phase 1 and Phase 2 Protected Species Survey: (*Prepared by Inscape and dated July 2010*)

- A Phase 1 site survey was undertaken on 15th April 2010 and Phase 2 Great Crested Newt, reptile and bat surveys were conducted between 15th April and 30th May 2010.
- No evidence of bats roosting in the buildings was found. Bats did not emerge from the buildings at dusk. Bats were seen to emerge from buildings in the Broughton Road area, foraged briefly around the buildings on site and flew off along the hedge line.
- No evidence of use of the site by reptiles was found.
- No evidence of Great Crested Newts was found in the pond 165m from the site to the south or using the ditch around the site. Other ponds shown on the OS map to the north of the site and within 250m of the site were not in existence at the time of survey despite wet conditions.
- The development of the site will not adversely impact on any protected species.

9. OFFICER APPRAISAL

Principle of Development

The site is located within the Crewe settlement boundary and policies in the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan allow for residential development in such locations. The site is a Saddlery business which is a retail use and therefore the requirement to market employment sites for other business uses, prior to allowing the redevelopment for residential use, under policy E7 of the Local Plan does not apply. The part of the site which includes the buildings is classed as previously developed land and the redevelopment of that land for residential use is also in accordance with guidance in PPS3: Housing. The paddocks are not previously developed land, nevertheless policy RES.2 of the adopted Local Plan allows for residential development of this area of land.

The site is also sustainably located being within close proximity of shops, employment sites and services with a bus route along Broughton Road. There are therefore no objections in principle to the residential development proposed in this application subject to appropriate design, highway requirements, impacts on ecology, residential amenity and other planning matters.

Since the site is located in the settlement boundary and the development is only for 11 dwellings there is no requirement to provide affordable housing within the development.

Design

The layout provides a group of 11 dwellings fronting onto the short section of roadway and turning head. As stated above the layout is based on Manual for Streets and provides for dwellings close to the highway to create a sense of enclosure and identity. The house types are mainly two and three bedroomed dwellings with one four bedroomed property, which is placed as a focal point at the end of the highway. It is a symmetrical double fronted dwelling with the front garden enclosed by a low wall. No details of the wall have been submitted and a condition would need to be attached to any permission for details to be submitted and agreed.

The dwellings are 2 storey which reflects the scale of adjacent dwellings in Broughton Road. The dwellings at 71-81 and 83-87 are terraced properties. However there are

semi-detached dwellings in this area of Broughton Road and there are therefore no objections to mainly semi-detached dwellings with one detached property.

Whilst the removal of the existing dwelling at 97 Broughton Road would allow the site to be fully redeveloped it is understood that the owner does not wish to move and therefore that dwelling is excluded from the layout. The proposed dwellings are in the main relatively close to the carriageway to create a sense of enclosure but with some variety in positions. In detail, all dwellings include some of the following features:- ridged roofs to dormer windows, chimneys, lean-to and ridged canopies over front doors, corbels, spar feet, soldier courses and brick plinths. Materials will include render and brickwork.

The layout provides for a single surface for use by vehicles and pedestrians including service strips. Different areas will be denoted by the use of the different materials and this approach to the management of traffic and the creation of a safe environment for pedestrians is in accordance with Manual for Streets.

The layout is in the main open plan. However the dwelling at plot 7 includes a low brick wall. Provided this is, as proposed, 600mm in height it will complement the highway planting which is close to the shared surface elsewhere on the cul de sac and is not in this context considered out of character. The low wall will help to provide some separation of public and private open space at the turning head. The adjacent semi-detached dwellings at plots 5/6 and 8/9 are set further back from the turning head at an angle and do not have such boundary treatment.

Bearing in mind the variety in design of the dwellings, their positions and the site layout it is considered that the development would create a small group of dwellings which will relate well in scale and design to the existing residential development in Broughton Road including the existing dwelling at 97 Broughton Road.

Highway Matters

A survey conducted in 2008 found that the average daily number of vehicle movements was 73.5 movements per day. Based on that figure it is considered that the site can accommodate 11 dwellings. Representations state that because the amount of traffic at the site has decreased since that time, the development should be based on current vehicle movements. However another operator could move into the site and take on the existing business without the need for planning permission and could potentially operate at a much higher level of activity than previously incurred. It would therefore be incorrect to require a reduced number of dwellings because of the present level of vehicle movements at the site.

The views of the Strategic Highways Manager are awaited. However through discussion it has been established that he accepts the principle of residential development on the site. A meeting took place with the agents, highway and planning officers to discuss amendments to the original layout in order to provide a layout which more closely resembles the type of highway layout encouraged in Manual for Streets. The amended plans and layout described at the start of the report are therefore based on the discussions.

The provision of two parking spaces for each dwelling accords with parking standards in the Local Plan and Government guidance which states that Local Planning Authorities should not seek to provide parking over and above that which is required to serve the

development. However additional space is available for 4/5 parking spaces within the highway area in accordance with the principles of providing on street parking in Manual for Streets.

The existing block of five garages which are just back from the access point are used by local residents but it is understood that only one of the garages is used for parking and the remaining ones are used for storage. These are relatively old garages and no planning records have been found for their construction. However the applicant's agent has stated that since one of the garages is used for car parking by the resident at 87 Broughton Road this space could be occupied by a garage for use by that dwelling. The views of the Strategic Highways Manager on the provision of a garage are awaited.

Residential Amenity

Representations raise concerns about the impact of the new development as a result of overlooking and loss of privacy. However, the proposed dwellings at plots 10 and 11 are over 24m from the rear of dwellings at 83-87 Broughton Road and since this is in excess of the minimum standard of 21m between windowed elevations in the SPD Development on Backland and Gardens it is not considered that the development will result in unreasonable overlooking to dwellings. Similarly the dwellings will not be so close as to unreasonably restrict light to the existing dwellings. The dwelling at plot 9 is over 30m from the dwellings in Broughton Road and for similar reasons there are no objections to its location.

The dwelling at plot 11 would have a relatively short rear garden in the order of 5-6m deep and the dwelling at plot 10 would have a slightly deeper rear garden varying from 6-9m. It is not considered that the development would result in unreasonable overlooking from first floor rear bedroom windows towards the rear end of gardens at dwellings at 79-83 Broughton Road. Similarly the development would not unreasonably dominate or overshadow that area of the gardens at the existing dwellings. This is particularly so since there is a mature Leylandii hedge on the boundary over 2m high, at this part of the site.

Within the development the layout would result in less than 21m between principal windowed elevations within the site at certain points. It is considered that this would be acceptable in order to create sense of enclosure and community within the development. The proposed dwelling at plot 1 would face the side elevation of the existing dwelling at 97 Broughton Road at a distance of 13m. There is a small first floor window in the side elevation at 97 Broughton Road which serves a bathroom. Whilst this separation distance of 13m is below the windowed elevation to blank elevation standard of 13.5m it is not considered that the shortfall is significant. Privacy would be afforded to ground floor rooms at 97 Broughton Road by the retention of the Leylandii hedge to the west and south of the property. The rear elevation at 97 Broughton Road would be 13.5m from the north gable of the dwelling at plot 11 and therefore meets the requirements of the spacing standards.

The existing porch on the front elevation of the dwelling at 97 Broughton Road would be removed and the road layout modified to increase the width of the access here. This would bring vehicle movements closer to the front elevation of this dwelling. However the owner has indicated that he does not wish to move from the site and the road design would include the provision of a hardstanding immediately adjacent to the dwelling with an upstand to ensure some separation between the front elevation and the highway.

There are windows in the side elevations of the dwellings at plots 5, 6, 10 and 11 which serve a landing. A condition should be attached to any permission to ensure that these windows are fitted with obscure glazing to ensure no overlooking to adjacent garden areas.

Whilst residents have raised objections to the development of the site on the grounds of impacts from construction traffic, site activities and disruption to services during the development of the site these are not grounds for consideration in the determination of the application.

Ecology

Phase 1 and Phase 2 surveys for reptiles, bats and Great Crested Newts have been submitted in relation to the planning application but no protected species were found on the site. The submitted surveys consider that the development will not adversely impact on any protected species and the Council's Ecologist agrees with this. Conditions are recommended to ensure that if development commences in the bird nesting season the buildings and trees to be removed are surveyed immediately prior to demolition / removal and protection be afforded to nesting birds. Also a condition should be attached to any permission for measures to provide features for nesting birds to be provided on site.

Landscape

The existing hedgerows to the north, east and south sides of the site will be retained. A new native hedgerow will be provided on the western boundary to replace a post and rail fence. There are two established trees on the application site and one smaller one. The large Oak on the northern boundary would be retained. There is an existing hardstanding under the crown spread of this tree within the application site and this would be unchanged by the development. The small tree and the established Oak both close to the eastern site boundary would be removed. The smaller tree is not considered to have any significant amenity value being overshadowed by the adjacent Oak. The Oak tree is well established but not as large as the tree on the northern site boundary. This tree could be retained but would grow too large for the garden area in which it would be situated. Further it has limited amenity value not being visible from public vantage points. It is therefore recommended that it be removed and a smaller tree provided of a more suitable species, together with other trees of appropriate species in other rear gardens.

The proposed layout with the front elevations relatively close together does not allow space for tree planting and the Highway Authority have indicated in discussion that they do not wish to see trees planted in highway land if the highway is to be adopted. However the layout proposed does include planted areas within the highway and shrub planting can provide effective landscaping within the built context in this situation.

Conditions should be attached for tree protection measures for the tree on the northern site boundary and the submission, approval and implementation of a landscaping scheme to include a native hedgerow to the western site boundary and tree planting in the larger rear gardens. It is noted that the submitted site layout includes details of tree and hedgerow planting. However, the sizes of the trees are in the main not appropriate and further details will be required for this. No details of planting in the highway areas have been provided.

Sustainable Development

Policy 10 (entitled minimising waste during construction and development) of the Cheshire Waste Replacement Local Plan requires redevelopment sites to agree details for the recycling and reuse of waste where existing buildings are to be demolished. The policy applies to residential development sites of 50 or more dwellings and requires details to be submitted with the planning application. This site is only for 11 dwellings. However the Design and Access Statement explains that a number of sustainable development practices will be incorporated into the development including the re-use of materials from existing buildings in hardstandings on the site. It is therefore recommended that a condition be attached to any permission for a scheme for the recycling and reuse of materials from the existing buildings/ hardstandings on the site to be submitted, approved and implemented.

The application also included information relating to other sustainable development measures which might be used in the development. A condition should be included on any permission for full details of all sustainable development measures to be submitted, approved and implemented.

The Design and Access Statement refers to the provision of solar panels on south facing roof areas. No details have been submitted and a condition should be included on any permission for details to be submitted, approved and implemented.

Other Matters

Representations raise concerns about impacts of the new development on the existing drainage network. However the site will be drained by a new system linking into the foul drainage on Broughton Road. A condition can be attached to any permission for a detailed drainage scheme to be submitted, approved and implemented. Surface water will be controlled by rain water harvesting schemes and permeable surfaces but no details have been submitted. Similarly a condition can be imposed for details of a scheme for the control of surface water to be submitted, approved and implemented.

Concerns about devaluation of property are not a matter to be considered in the determination of the planning application.

10. CONCLUSIONS

The site is located within the Crewe Settlement boundary. Policies in the Adopted Local Plan allow for residential development within this area. The siting of the dwellings respects the pattern of development in the locality and the scale of dwellings is appropriate for this Backland site. The number of movements from the proposed dwellings would reflect the number of vehicle movements generated by the Saddlery business and there are no objections in principle to the number of dwellings proposed.

The position of the dwellings will not adversely impact on residential amenities at existing nearby dwellings. The development is therefore considered to comply with policies for new residential development in the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Replacement Local Plan.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

Subject to the views of the Strategic Highway Manager, APPROVE with the following conditions:-

- 1. Commencement within 3 years**
- 2. Amended plans**
- 3. Samples / details of external materials to be used in the construction of the dwellings to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 4. Details of surface materials to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 5. Details of boundary treatment to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 6. Tree protection measures to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 7. Tree on northern site boundary to be retained unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.**
- 8. Existing hedges around the site to be retained unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority**
- 9. No close board or other similar fences to be placed against existing boundary hedgerows or new hedgerow provided on the western site boundary at any time.**
- 10. If demolition or development commence in bird nesting season the site to be checked for nesting birds and protection afforded to any nests.**
- 11. Details of measures for nesting birds to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 12. No development to commence and no demolition until a scheme for the recycling and reuse of materials from the existing buildings/ structures on site has been submitted and approved. Works to proceed only in accordance with the approved details.**
- 13. Full details of all sustainable development measures to be incorporated in the development to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 14. Details of external lighting to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 15. Construction hours and delivery hours to be limited to 0800-1800 hours Mondays to Friday and 0800-1400 hours on Saturdays with no working on Sundays and Bank Holidays.**
- 16. Details of pile driving to be submitted, approved and implemented if required.**
- 17. Contaminated land survey to be submitted with remediation if necessary and implementation of remediation.**
- 18. Scheme for foul drainage to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 19. Scheme for the control and storage of surface water run off to be submitted, approved and implemented. To be based on Sustainable Drainage solutions with use of permeable hard surfaces.**
- 20. Details of levels to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 21. Obscure glazing to be provided to the side elevations of plots 5, 6, 10 and 11.**
- 22. Details of the boundary walls adjacent to plot 10 and in front of plot 7 to be submitted, approved and implemented.**
- 23. Details of levels to be submitted, approved and implemented.**

LOCATION PLAN: Licence No: 100049045

